

ccNSO Council Meeting – Face to Face  
15 March 2017

**Attendees:**

**AF**

Abdalla Omari, .ke

Souleymane Oumtanaga, .ci

**AP**

Debbie Monahan, .nz

Hiro Hotta, .jp

Young-Eum Lee, .kr

**EU**

Nigel Roberts, .gg & .je

Katrina Sataki, .lv

Peter Vergote, .be

**LAC**

Alejandra Reynoso, .gt

Demi Getschko, .br

Margarita Valdes, .cl

**NA**

Pablo Rodriguez, .pr

Byron Holland, .ca

Stephen Deerhake, .as

**NomCom**

Christelle Vaval (remote)

Ching Chiao

Jian Zhang

**Observers/Liaisons**

Maureen Hilyard, ALAC Observer to the ccNSO

**Regional Organizations**

Barrack Otieno, AfTLD

Andres Piazza, LACTLD

Leonid Todorov, APTLD

Peter Van Roste, CENTR

## ICANN Staff

Bart Boswinkel

Kim Carlson

Joke Braeken

## 1 Apologies

Abibu Ntahigiye, .tz

Attendance list is available at: <http://ccnso.icann.org/about/council/attendance.htm>

Young-Eum Lee announced a request from Marilyn Cade to contribute to picture book for the retiring Glen de Saint Gery (ICANN Staff).

## 2 Minutes and Actions

Minutes 9 February 2016 have been published and approved.

Action points are completed

## 3 Overview inter-meeting Council decisions

There have been no inter-meeting decisions.

## 4 ccNSO Travel funding: ccNSO Council request to increase number travel slots

The ccNSO discussed the creation of a drafting team that would consider the rationale of asking for additional travel slots for the ccNSO. This drafting team would then present their finding and proposal to the ccNSO Council. The Council would then evaluate the findings, before making a final decision. The Chair further noted, proposal for Nigel Roberts to chair this drafting team.

### ***RESOLUTION 127-01:***

The ccNSO Council initiates the ccNSO Council procedure to prepare a submission to the ICANN FY 2018 Budget and/or Operational Plan seeking an increase in the number of ccNSO traveling slots. The ccNSO Council designates Nigel Roberts as lead of the drafting team and request the Secretariat to send out a call for volunteers to take part in the drafting team. In preparing the Council Statement the drafting team is requested to propose a reasonable number of traveling slots and the rationale for the proposed number.

### ***Action 127-01:***

Secretariat to initiate call for volunteers – Drafting team (travel funding)

### **5 CSC Charter review**

The Chair discussed the CSC charter review. This must be done jointly with the RySG. The amendments to the charter (if any), will need to be adopted by both the ccNSO and GNSO Councils.

The proposed timeline was included in prep material. If there are any changes to the charter, they must be adopted by ICANN61. This will be discussed in more detail during next Council meeting.

### **6 ccNSO review**

The Chair noted ICANN.org has asked to confirm if the ccNSO wants to proceed with the organizational review as scheduled or ask to defer (workload, other reviews, etc.)

### ***RESOLUTION 127-02:***

The Chair of the ccNSO is requested to inform the chair of the ICANN Board Organizational Effectiveness Committee that the ccNSO requests to defer the start of the ccNSO Organizational Review by twelve months.

### **7 CCWG IG updated charter**

The Chair stated an update was received from the CCWG on Internet Governance, just a few days before the start of the meeting. To allow adequate time to review the charter, discussion and adoption will be deferred to next Council meeting.

### **8 FoI Implementation Advisory team**

The Chair noted this was also discussed during the prep meeting. There were two experts on this team, Becky Burr and Keith Davidson. Becky Burr was unable to continue due to her commitments to the Board, and Stephen Deerhake was appointed. Fortunately, Keith Davidson has re-confirmed his commitment to this team. Team will be revisited if one of the current members steps down.

### **9 Annual Work plan**

Update & next steps

The Chair further noted the annual work plan will be presented to the Council at its next meeting - considering the outcome of this meeting.

### **10 Roles and responsibilities of Councilors.**

The Chair stated the roles and responsibilities will need to be further discussed. There are several committees such as Triage and Travel funding, etc. Some of the committees have a limited number of years a councilor can serve. These topics will be discussed at the next Council meeting.

*Consent agenda/administrative topics*

Moved by Nigel Roberts

Seconded by Stephen Deerhake

Passed unanimously

Byron Holland commented on agenda topic 4 – as the chair of the finance working group, when the group came to the conclusions about the financial contributions to ICANN, one of the key elements as to not being bound by financial contributions, is that the ccNSO does not receive much travel funding. And wants to remind the group to keep this in mind.

Debbie Monahan stated as nothing has been decided, she would like any reference to the matter not be published.

The Chair confirmed only what was discussed will be in the minutes.

Debbie Monahan added it was her understanding the agenda was published. The Chair confirmed that no decision has been made yet and thus no reference to decisions should be published.

### *SUBSTANTIVE TOPICS*

#### **11 ccNSO Resolutions on ccPDP 3**

##### **ccNSO Policy Development Process on introduction of a Review Mechanism and Retirement of country code Top Level Domains**

The Chair stated the Council received documentation in the prep material as well as discussion on this during the Members day. Temperature of the room was taken.

Nigel Roberts added there seems to be a “green light” for what is proposed. There was a discussion on the order, whether retirement was first or review. This was split evenly. After discussion with members and the issues manager, it was proposed to do the retirement first.

In summary, the Chair confirmed one PDP, retirement first then review mechanism. Timeline was presented – shows this approach will help save three months. Personally, speaking, the Chair does not think it will save any time, but initial calculations indicate this would help save time.

Bart Boswinkel, issue manager, discussed the options available, which is in line with Annex B of the ICANN bylaws: A - would be to initiate one PDP, B – which to initiate first (review mechanism or retirement), C to appoint two working groups with their own charter and, working method and schedule.

Moved by Stephen Deerhake

Seconded by Alejandra Reynoso

Peter Vergote asked for clarification – for proposed resolution 4, is there any indication how the ICANN Board may respond to this recommendation?

The Chair asked Chris Disspain to address this concern.

Chris Disspain noted he thinks “this is fine”, but cannot guarantee anything if there should be an emergency, but is unable to think of an instance of where an emergency would come up.

Nigel Roberts noted he believes, in response to Peter Vergote’s question, the Board will say “thank you this is very helpful”.

The Chair further described each of the alternatives offered for #1.

Nigel Roberts and Debbie Monahan discussed how the vote should be taken – voting for or against each of the options presented.

Vote 1A all in favor

Vote 1B (alternative 1) – 2 in favor, 11 against, Ching Chiao abstained

Vote 1B (alternative 2) – 15 in favor, 1 against, Christelle abstained

Vote C – all in favor

Vote – 2, 3, 4, 5 – all in favor (Christelle did not vote)

***RESOLUTION 127-03:***

1. In accordance with Annex B section 3 and 4 of the ICANN Bylaws, the ccNSO Council decides that:

- A. Based on a review of the issues, considering that the Threshold Criteria are met, and taking into account General Counsel's opinion, the Issues Manager's recommendation is to initiate one (1) ccNSO Policy Development Process to develop policies for a Review Mechanism and on the retirement of ccTLDs.
  - B. The initial focus needs to be on developing a policy for Retirement of ccTLDs, and only after the substantive work has been concluded the focus should be on developing recommendations pertaining to the Review Mechanism o decisions on delegation, transfer, revocation and retirement of ccTLDs.
  - C. To appoint two working groups each with its own charter, working method and schedule.
- 2 The Secretariat is requested to send out a call for volunteers for the first WG, and invite other stakeholders listed in the relevant charter, to participate in the WG in the manner most suited to them.
  - 3 As required under Annex B, the Chair of the ccNSO is requested to formally inform the Chair of the GAC and ask the GAC to advise or provide an opinion.
  - 4 The Chair of the ccNSO is requested to recommend the ICANN Board of Directors to defer any decisions pertaining to the retirement of a ccTLD until such a time the policy for the retirement of the ccTLD has been developed following this ccNSO PDP 3 and adopted and implemented by ICANN.
  - 5 The Secretariat is requested is publish this resolution as soon as possible and upon publication it becomes effective.

***Action 127-02:***

Secretariat to initiate call for volunteers – PDP

***Action 127-03:***

Chair to inform the Chair of the GAC and ICANN Board - PDP

***Action 127-04:***

Publish resolution as soon as possible - PDP

**12 Council Updates**

12.1 Chair Update – The Chair noted she has already updated the Council – has nothing new to

add.

12.2 Vice-Chair Update – Byron Holland added that as Chair of the CSC, they met with the Board and the GAC and the meetings went very well.

12.3 Councilors Update - none

12.4 Regional Organizations Update - none

12.5 Secretariat update - none

### **13 Liaison Updates**

13.1 GNSO Update (written update to follow).

13.2 ALAC Update (written update to follow).

### **14 Participation/assistance ccNSO in GAC WG Underserved regions preparing FAQ on delegation, transfer and revocation**

Again, as discussed during the prep meeting, the Chair noted the ccNSO was approached by GAC's underserved regions working group. They try to mitigate cases where governments ask questions, e.g., about ccTLDs being non-responsive. The WG has come up with frequently asked questions and explained terminology – including where ICANN can help and when ICANN should not interfere.

#### ***RESOLUTION 127-04:***

The ccNSO Council expresses its interest to assist the GAC Underserved regions WG to prepare a FAQ and high level informational document to explain procedures around delegation, transfer and revocation of ccTLDs.

Once details are better understood the Secretariat is requested to send out an appropriate call for volunteers.

Nigel Roberts commented it is welcomed the GAC has come to the ccNSO at this early stage.

Moved by Nigel Roberts

Seconded by Peter Vergote

Passed unanimously

#### ***Action 127-05:***

Once details are better understood the Secretariat is requested to send out an appropriate call

for volunteers. (GAC Underserved region WG)

## **15 AOB**

Nothing was brought forward

## **16 ccNSO Chair and vice – chair elections**

Starting with the selection of the ccNSO Chair – the Chair passed the chairmanship to vice-chair, Byron Holland.

Byron Holland asked for nominations.

Debbie Monahan nominated Katrina Sataki.

Seconded by Nigel Roberts.

Nomination was accepted by Katrina Sataki.

No other nominations were brought forward.

Katrina Sataki has been re-selected as Chair of the ccNSO Council

The chairmanship was passed back to Katrina Sataki. The Chair has discussed the selection of the Vice-Chairs.

Pablo Rodrigues proposed Stephen Deerhake.

Seconded by Ching Chiao.

Debbie Monahan nominated Demi Getschko and Byron Holland.

Both seconded by Alejandra Reynoso.

Candidates have all accepted nominations.

The Chair explained there is an unwritten rule that there can be only one person in leadership from a region. Two slots are available; one slot would be Demi Getschko and the other would be either Byron Holland or Stephen Deerhake.

Young-Eum Lee stated as this “could get personal”, she recommends an anonymous vote.

Nigel Roberts, in response, noted agreement and voting should be done by secret ballot.

It was suggested by both Bart Boswinkel and Young-Eum Lee, voting should be done just on the one slot where there are two candidates from the same region.

Secretariat is requested to create a ballot.

Vote for Demi Getschko – 12 in favor, 3 abstained.

Vote between Byron Holland and Stephen Deerhake – 12 Byron Holland, 5 Stephen Deerhake

(Christelle Vaval could vote via private chat in Adobe) – Representative(s) from the regional organization observed the vote count.

The Chair thanked all the candidates.

### **17 Next meetings**

- 13 April 2017, 18.00 UTC
- 18 May 2017, 12.00 UTC
- June 2017 (f-2-f) to be confirmed, depending on ccNSO meeting schedule at ICANN 59

### **18 Thank you**

Norid for sponsoring the ccNSO cocktail and again congratulated with its 30<sup>th</sup> year Anniversary.

DK Hostmaster for support and welcome at this Copenhagen meeting.

To every ccNSO member here and remote and to all the Councilors for their commitment and active participation.

To the ccNSO Secretariat.

### **19 Closure**