Minutes

ccNSO Council meeting 210
Thursday, 17 October 2024 at 21:00 UTC

Table of contents

Decisions
Action items
Attendees
Apologies received
Background and supporting documents
Agenda

Decisions

- ***Resolution 210-01***

THE CCNSO COUNCIL RESOLVES TO appoint the following persons to the roles for the respective group or committee listed next to their names:

Antonia Nan Chu (CNNIC) - ccNSO liaison to GNSO Council

Sabrina Wilkinson (.ca) - member UAC

Benedict Obirim Sagoe (.gh) - member UAC

Maria Kolesnikova (.ru) - member UAC

The secretariat is requested to inform all volunteers and where appropriate, the committee or working group leadership teams and relevant ICANN staff, according to the designations above. The secretariat is requested to publish this resolution as soon as possible on the ccNSO website. This resolution becomes effective upon publication.

Action items

- ***Action Item 210-01***

Regarding the appointment of the members to the various working groups and committees, the secretariat is requested to inform all volunteers and where appropriate, the committee or working group leadership teams and relevant ICANN staff, according to the designations in resolution 210-01. The secretariat is requested to publish this resolution as soon as possible on the ccNSO website.

- ***Action Item 210-02***

The secretariat is requested to prepare an online decision, for Council to approve Pablo Rodriguez' request to join the ccNSO Internet Governance Liaison Committee

- ***Action Item 210-03***

Secretariat to confirm to the NomCom operations team that no changes are needed to the current job description for the NomCom-appointed ccNSO Councillor.

- ***Action Item 210-04***

Secretariat to add the topic of relaunching the call for volunteers for the role of ccNSO liaison to ALAC to the agenda of Council meeting 211.

- ***Action Item 210-05***

Councillors are requested to review the draft general invite to ccTLD managers to become ccNSO members, in preparation of Council meeting 211.

- ***Action Item 210-06***

Once finalised by the Triage Committee and Council Chair, the Secretariat is requested to circulate the ICANN 81 Council workshop overview to all participants.

- ***Action Item 210-07***

Secretariat to inform ICANN Board Support about the ccNSO proposed topics for the joint meeting between ccNSO and ICANN Board at ICANN81.

Attendees

Africa
- ☑ Ali Hadji Mmadi, .km
- ☑ Biyi Oladipo, .ng (Vice-Chair)
- ☐ Molehe Wesi, .za

Asia/Australia/Pacific
- ☑ Jordan Carter, .au (Vice-Chair)
- ☑ Ai-Chin Lu
- ☑ Jiankang Yao, .cn

Europe
- ☑ Chris Disspain
- ☐ Peter Koch, .de
- ☑ Nick Wenban-Smith, .uk

Latin America/ Caribbean
- ☑ Demi Getschko, .br
- ☑ Jenifer Lopez, .pa
- ☑ Alejandra Reynoso (Chair)

North America
- ☑ Sean Copeland, .vi
- ☐ Stephen Deerhake, .as
- ☑ Pablo Rodriguez, .pr

NomCom appointed Councillors
- ☑ Olga Cavalli
- ☑ Wafa Dahmani

Liaisons to ccNSO, appointed by ALAC and GNSO
- ☐ Desiree Miloshevic, GNSO liaison to ccNSO Council

☑ Laura Margolis, ALAC liaison to ccNSO Council

ICANN Staff
☑ Joke Braeken
☑ Bart Boswinkel
☑ Claudia Ruiz

Invited Guests
☑ None

Apologies received

Molehe Wesi, Peter Koch

Background and supporting documents

- Council workspace for this meeting:
  https://community.icann.org/x/NQEZEw
- ccNSO correspondence: statements and responses:
  https://ccnso.icann.org/en/about/statements.htm

Agenda

1. **Welcome and roll call**

Welcome by Alejandra Reynoso, the Chair of the ccNSO.
There are no objections to the proposed agenda as circulated.

   a. ***Establish whether meeting is Quorate***

 Claudia Ruiz, ccNSO Secretariat, confirmed the meeting is quorate

   b. ***Update Statement of Interest***

No updates were disclosed.

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

2. **Relevant Correspondence**

3. **Minutes & Action Items**

   a. ***Minutes Meeting 209: Circulated 14 October 2024***

The prior meeting's minutes are approved.

   b. ***Action items:***

All action items from the previous meeting are completed. No questions or comments were raised regarding the action items. In the interest of time, agenda items 4 to 9 were skipped.

- ***Action item 209-01*** (Completed)

Regarding the appointment of the members to the various working groups and committees, the secretariat is requested to inform all volunteers and where appropriate, the committee or working group leadership teams and relevant ICANN staff, according to the designations in resolution 209-01. The secretariat is requested to publish this resolution as soon as possible on the ccNSO website.

- ***Action item 209-02*** (Completed)

The secretariat is requested to publish the most recently adopted version of the ccNSO Travel Support Guideline as soon as possible on the ccNSO website.

- ***Action Item 209-03*** (Deferred to this Council meeting, see item 17)

Councillors are requested to review the proposed draft invitation letter for ccTLD managers to become ccNSO Members. Following closure of the comments period, the ccNSO Secretariat should ensure the proposed draft gets adopted by Council.

- ***Action Item 209-04*** (Completed, however no volunteers)

The Secretariat is requested to circulate the call for volunteers to join the DASC Review Team among Councillors and the broader community. Furthermore, the ccNSO Secretariat is requested to circulate the proposed Terms of Reference for the DASC Review Team to Council for adoption.

- ***Action Item 209-05*** (Completed)

The Council requests its chair to inform the Board Caucus, by sending the cover letter and response that was drafted for that purpose, after the resolution to adopt the response to the Board Caucus questions on ccPDP3-Review Mechanism becomes effective. The Council requests the secretariat to publish the cover letter and response on the ccNSO website correspondence page.

4. Intermeeting Decisions (since meeting 209, September 2024)

209-A: Adoption Terms of Reference DASC Effectiveness Review
In the interest of time, agenda item 4 was skipped.

5. Intermeeting Decisions Triage Committee

The Triage Committee has made no decisions since the last meeting.
In the interest of time, agenda item 5 was skipped.

UPDATES

6. Update ECA, IFRT & CSC (written updates)

Written updates were provided. In the interest of time, agenda item 6 was skipped.

7. Update Working Groups (written updates)

Written updates were provided. In the interest of time, agenda item 7 was skipped.

    a. ***ccPDP3-Review Mechanism*** *- Dormant*
    b. ***ccPDP4-IDN*** *- Dormant*
    c. ***DASC***
    d. ***GRC***
    e. ***IGLC***
    f. ***MPC***
    g. ***OMC*** *- First meeting prior to ICANN81*
    h. ***PGA WG***
    i. ***SOPC*** *– Had no meeting since meeting 209*
    j. ***Tech WG*** *- Had no meeting since Council meeting 209*
    k. ***TLD-OPS SC*** *- Had no meeting since Council meeting 209*
    l. ***UAC***
    m. ***Triage Committee*** *- See items 16 and 19 b.*
    n. ***CCG WS2 Implementation*** *- Had no meeting since Council meeting 208*
    o. ***IRP Panel Selection*** - Had no meeting since Council concluded its work, panel was appointed (see: https://www.icann.org/en/announcements/details/icann-announces-standing-panel-for-independent-review-process-23-09-2024-en). Will no longer be included
    p. ***Planning Prioritization Process group*** *- Had no meeting since Council meeting 208*
    q. ***RZERC***
    r. ***RSS GWG***
    s. ***CIP-CCG***

8. Update Liaisons (written updates)

Written updates were provided (if any). In the interest of time, agenda item 8 was skipped.

    a. ***Update ccNSO Liaison to ALAC***
    b. ***Update ccNSO Liaison to GNSO Council***
    c. ***Update ccNSO Liaison to UASG***

9. Update ccNSO Website redesign

Informational: No meeting since Council meeting 209.
In the interest of time, agenda item 9 was skipped.

10. Update Chair, Vice-chairs, Councillors, Regional Organisations and Secretariat

Alejandra Reynoso, Council Chair, referred to her recent meeting with Sally Costerton, Interim President & CEO at ICANN. The main topic of discussion was "How We Meet"; i.e., how ICANN org and the community can collaborate to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of meetings in the current economic environment. There is a suggestion to do a light review of the meeting strategy, meaning that the review would be conducted by a small team, not a full cross-community working group. Chris Disspain, ccNSO Council member for the European Region, expressed concerns regarding the light review, and the attempts to restructure the way the org works, without using existing mechanisms. He furthermore added that only a proper cross community group has standing to make recommendations for changes. Alejandra mentioned that further details would become available at ICANN 81. Additionally, Alejandra referred to her update to LACTLD, and to the fact that the GNSO appointed Mike Rodenbaugh as representative to the IANA Community Coordination Group.

Jordan Carter, Council Vice Chair, mentioned he gave an update to the 86th APTLD AGM, where he reminded the audience about five calls to action regarding ccNSO-related matters. He also referred to the meeting by the ICANN WSIS+20 Coordination Group, where they discussed the process. Chris Disspain, one of the Councillors appointed to the WSIS+20 Coordination Group, confirmed the first meeting focussed around the scope.

11. Update Board Seat 12 Nomination Process by the Nomination Process Manager

Nick Wenban-Smith, Council member for the European region, started by saying that he is a candidate for the Board Seat 12, and asked whether he needed to recuse himself. Alejandra Reynoso confirmed there was no need to do so.

Joke Braeken, Nomination Process Manager, confirmed the nomination period for ICANN Board Seat 12 closed on 27 September 2024 at 23:59 UTC. Two candidates, Byron Holland and Nick Wenban-Smith, were nominated, seconded, and accepted their nominations before the deadline, as per the applicable rules. Due diligence for both candidates has begun. One additional nominee declined to accept their nomination.

In line with the relevant guidelines and the timeline agreed upon by the ccNSO Council, an election will be held. The election will begin on 4 February 2025 (00:01 UTC), following the completion of due diligence and an opportunity for ccNSO members to interact with the candidates. The ccNSO members will propose and elect candidates for ICANN Board Seats 11 and 12, allocated to the ccNSO. The winner of the election—defined as the candidate receiving the most votes—will then be nominated to the ICANN Board by a majority vote of the ccNSO Council.

A Question & Answer session is planned between 22 and 28 January 2025, providing the ccNSO members and the broader ccTLD community an opportunity to engage with the candidates. In preparation for this session, the candidates have been invited to submit written statements, which can be found on the ccNSO website.

12. Update Council Election Process by the Election Process Manager

Joke Braeken, Election Process Manager, provided the following updates:
- The 3-year term for five members of the ccNSO Council will end in March 2025.
- Nominations for the upcoming election will close on 22 October 2024.
- Current Status of Nominations:
  - No nominations have been received for the LAC and EU regions to date.
- As per the ccNSO Guideline:
  - Only Representatives from ccNSO member organisations can nominate and second candidates for the position of ccNSO Councillor.
  - In line with previous election rounds, Representatives were consulted to confirm their agreement with nominations or secondments made by non-Representatives.

Q&A Session Details:
- A Question and Answer session with the candidate(s) will take place on Wednesday, 12 November 2024, during ICANN81:
  - Time: 13:15–14:30 local time in Istanbul (10:15–11:30 UTC)

If at the close of nominations there are no more valid candidates in a particular geographic region than there are seats on the ccNSO Council available for that geographic region, then the nominated candidates shall be selected to serve on the ccNSO Council. Otherwise, an election shall be held for that geographic region, to select the ccNSO Councillors from among the valid candidates. The first election round (if any), will start Wednesday, 27 November 2024 (00:01 UTC) and will close Wednesday, 18 December 2024 (23:59 UTC), as per the timeline adopted by the Council.

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS & DECISIONS

13. Appointment members to committees and working groups, if any

The ccNSO Council adopted the decision to appoint the various members to the respected roles and groups. No further questions or comments were raised regarding this agenda item.

Alejandra Reynoso expressed her disappointment that none of the eligible Council members volunteered to join the DASC review team. Furthermore, no volunteers applied for the role of liaison to ALAC. She added that the Council workshop at ICANN 81 will focus on resourcing and prioritisation: a timely topic, seeing the lack of volunteers. Olga Cavalli, Nomcom appointed Councillor, asked whether NomCom appointed Councillors are eligible as liaisons, and Alejandra confirmed that councillors are not eligible for this position. She furthermore added that Pablo Rodriguez's request to join IGLC arrived after drafting of the Council resolutions, and that his appointment would be deferred to an online decision.

- ***Resolution 210-01***

THE CCNSO COUNCIL RESOLVES TO appoint the following persons to the roles for the respective group or committee listed next to their names:

Antonia Nan Chu (CNNIC) - ccNSO liaison to GNSO Council
Sabrina Wilkinson (.ca) - member UAC
Benedict Obirim Sagoe (.gh) - member UAC
Maria Kolesnikova (.ru) - member UAC
The secretariat is requested to inform all volunteers and where appropriate, the committee or working group leadership teams and relevant ICANN staff, according to the designations above. The secretariat is requested to publish this resolution as soon as possible on the ccNSO website. This resolution becomes effective upon publication.

- ***Action Item 210-01***

Regarding the appointment of the members to the various working groups and committees, the secretariat is requested to inform all volunteers and where appropriate, the committee or working group leadership teams and relevant ICANN staff, according to the designations in resolution 210-01. The secretariat is requested to publish this resolution as soon as possible on the ccNSO website.

- ***Action Item 210-02***

The secretariat is requested to prepare an online decision, for Council to approve Pablo Rodriguez' request to join the ccNSO Internet Governance Liaison Committee

14. Skills and expectation NomCom appointee to the ccNSO Council

Alejandra Reynoso mentioned that the NomCom operations team requested a review of the current job description for the NomCom-appointed ccNSO Councillor. The last review of the job description occurred two years ago. After review, no changes to the current job description are deemed necessary. No questions or comments were raised during the meeting.

- ***Action Item 210-03***

Secretariat to confirm to the NomCom operations team that no changes are needed to the current job description for the NomCom-appointed ccNSO Councillor.

15. ccNSO Liaison to the ALAC: next steps

Alejandra Reynoso mentioned that recently the ccNSO launched a call for expression of interest to become the ccNSO liaison to ALAC. Although the call was extended, no expressions of interest were received. Alejandra listed 3 options, regarding the next steps
- Re-launch call for volunteers: starting ICANN81, include announcement during opening of ccNSO meetings
- Launch new call by ICANN82 (Seattle)
- No Action: reconsider decision September 2025.

Nick Wenban-Smith, Council member for the European region, asked what the benefit would be for volunteers to take on the role. Chris Disspain, Council member for the European region, questioned whether it makes sense to continue having a liaison to ALAC, since the topics addressed by ALAC are often not of interest to the ccNSO Council. Pablo Rodriguez, Council member for the North America region, interjected that it would nonetheless be beneficial to keep the exchange open. Council decided to relaunch the call for volunteers would be on the agenda at the Council meeting during ICANN 81.

- ***Action Item 210-04***

Secretariat to add the topic of relaunching the call for volunteers for the role of ccNSO liaison to ALAC to the agenda of Council meeting 211.

16. Quarterly Monitor Progress ccNSO Activities

Nick Wenban-Smith, Chair Council Triage Committee, confirmed that the most recent quarterly review of the ccNSO Activities Monitor by the committee revealed no major changes are necessary.

17. Introduction and discussion text general invite ccTLD managers to become ccNSO members

Alejandra Reynoso referred to a request for the Council to send a letter inviting an individual ccTLD to join the ccNSO as a member. The Council previously emphasised that any such letter must be addressed to the current ccTLD Manager listed in the Root Zone delegation record. The Secretariat was tasked with drafting a boilerplate text for this purpose and submitting it to the Council for review. The final version is to be adopted during Council Meeting 211.

- ***Action Item 210-05***

Councillors are requested to review the draft general invite to ccTLD managers to become ccNSO members, in preparation of Council meeting 211.

18. Introducing the Pilot Holistic Review

The pilot Holistic Review held its inaugural meeting on 30 September. Irina, Chris and Demi were selected and appointed by the ccNSO. Chris Disspain noted that there is some confusion about the Holistic Review being different from ATRT3. Emphasis was placed on aligning understanding and ensuring all stakeholders are on the same page. He added that Upcoming work will focus on defining the scope and purpose of the Holistic Review, and that further updates are to follow.

SUBSTANTIVE MATTERS & DECISIONS

19. ccNSO Schedule ICANN81

i. Council preparatory meeting

Alejandra Reynoso confirmed that to prepare for the ccNSO response to the question from the Board, the leadership team of the SOPC was invited to the Council Workshop.

ii. Council workshop: Tentative What will be adequate resourcing the next five years and how can we achieve this.

Regarding the topic of resourcing as a critical factor, Nick Wenban-Smith, Chair of the Triage Committee, emphasised the importance of aligning resources with the future workload, given the numerous ongoing activities as part of the Continuous Improvement (CI) initiative. During ICANN 81, a brainstorming session is planned to explore how to:
- Better match resources with workload.
- Define what "good" looks like.
- Improve efficiency and productivity.

Participants are encouraged to review distributed materials in advance to align with the session's objectives.   An overview document will be circulated, including background information and links for reference.

Bart Boswinkel, ccNSO Secretariat, announced a 4-page document with background details and clickable links would be provided.   The discussion will begin in Istanbul during ICANN81, followed by:
- Creation of an action plan.
- A virtual follow-up session post-ICANN81.

The session will include three discussion questions, with input captured using flip charts.

Bart noted that remote participation may present challenges and he proposed inviting leadership teams of various committees and working groups (WG/Cs) to participate in the session.

Alejandra and the Council agreed. Nick supported the involvement, highlighting the useful work done by the WG/Cs.

- **Action Item 210-06**

Once finalised by the Triage Committee and Council Chair, the Secretariat is requested to circulate the ICANN 81 Council workshop overview to all participants.

iii. Council meeting

iv. Joint meeting: ccNSO and ICANN Board

The ccNSO and the ICANN Board will hold a joint meeting to discuss issues of common interest.
- ccNSO topics for discussion

- ○ Knowing that Board members are active in various committees, working groups and caucuses, and knowing that Board members step down regularly (end-of term, for other reasons), is progress and continuity ensured of the (smaller) groups, specifically those groups that deal with community work (policy development, advisories, other work).
  - ○ What are the next steps regarding the requests for Bylaw amendments? Noting that no progress was noted since Hamburg on the suggested bylaw amendment to adjust the frequency of the CSC effectiveness reviews.
  - ○ Progress Board consideration ccPDP3 and ccPDP4
- ● Board topics for discussion
  - ○ Knowing that the ccNSO has a standing committee, the SOPC, that for many years has been doing good work on providing input on budget and related matters, what does the SOPC and the ccNSO in general think about what ICANN is doing and should be doing about its current financial stress? Any thoughts about the financial future of ICANN?

- ● ***Action Item 210-07***

Secretariat to inform ICANN Board Support about the ccNSO proposed topics for the joint meeting between ccNSO and ICANN Board at ICANN81.

v. *Joint meeting: ccNSO and GAC*

Topics for discussion:
- Introducing Policy Gap Analysis & progress to date
- WSIS+20: goal is to look for commonalities in the approach to WSIS+20.
- Highlights of the 2nd DNS Abuse survey

vi. *Working Group and Committee meetings*

vii. *Tech Day*

viii. *ccNSO Members Meeting sessions*

ix. *Plenary Session*

Bart Boswinkel, ccNSO Secretariat, referenced the presentation during the ccNSO Members Meeting, which will highlight the first set of survey results from DASC. These results will also be shared with ALAC and GAC.

Peter Koch, ccNSO Council member for the European Region and a member of the plenary session planning group, provided a written update on the session planning. To date, the planning group focussed on the session's scope and discussed how "broad Internet Governance" should be interpreted.

20. AOB

Sean Copeland, GRC chair, referred to the recent World Cafe Session on voting improvements. He alluded to suggestions by the community that might increase voting participation.
Biyi Oladipo, Council Vice Chair, referred to the upcoming ccNSO webinar for newcomers, and invited fellow Council members to join the session and to spread the word, but also to actively invite interested community members to join.

21. Next Council Meetings

- 14 November 2024 | 10:15-11:30 UTC, Meeting 211 (at ICANN81)
- 12 December 2024 | 12:00 UTC, Meeting 212
- 16 January 2025 | 18:00 UTC, Meeting 213
- 13 February 2025 | 12:00 UTC, Meeting 214

22. Adjourn